

REMARKS

Claims 1-4, 14-17 and 19-20 are pending in this application.

Claim 1 is currently amended to incorporate the limitations of claims 19 and 20. Accordingly, claims 19 and 20 are cancelled.

Claim 17 is currently amended to delete the terms "butylated hydroxyanisole, tocopherol, and ascorbic acid".

No new matter is added.

Claims 1-4 and 14-17 are presented for reconsideration.

Claim Objections – 37 CFR 1.75(c)

Claims 19 and 20 are objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c), as being improper dependent form for failing to further limit the subject matter of a previous claim.

The subject matter of claims 19 and 20 is incorporated into currently amended claim 1. Accordingly, claims 19 and 20 are cancelled.

The present claim objections under 37 CFR 1.75(c) are addressed and are overcome.

Claim Rejection – 35 USC 103(a)

Claims 1-4, 14-17, 19 and 20 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Nesvadba (US 5,814,692) in view of Griffith et al. (US 2,768,084).

Nesvadba states that the compounds are suitable for stabilizing organic materials against oxidative degradation. Some of these materials are naturally occurring organic materials (column 28, item 29). Nesvadba is totally silent with regard to what type of food stuff or food stuffs containing fatty acid glycerides, edible fats or fatty oils that may be stabilized.

Griffith et al teaches a limited number of antioxidants in food stuffs. The antioxidants that Griffith et al. teach include: butylated hydroxyanisole (BHA), tocopherols, antioxidant acids (citric, tartaric or phosphoric acids), and gallic acid esters.

Claim 17 is currently amended to delete the terms "butylated hydroxyanisole, tocopherol, and ascorbic acid".

The subject matter of claims 19 and 20 are incorporated into currently amended claim 1. Accordingly, claims 19 and 20 are cancelled.

The elements of the instant amended claims can not be derived from US 5,814,692 and US 2,768,084, either alone or collectively; hence the limitations are not met. Therefore, the present invention is not obvious to one skilled in the art.

In light of this discussion, the Applicants submit that the 35 USC 103(a) rejection is addressed and is overcome.

The Examiner is kindly requested to reconsider and to withdraw the present rejection.

Applicants submit that the present claims are in condition for allowance and respectfully request that they be found allowable.

Respectfully submitted,

Reg No.

Mervin G. Wood 56,880
For

Mervin G. Wood, Ph. D.
Agent for Applicants
Reg. No. 56,711

Ciba Corporation
Patent Department
540 White Plains Road
P.O. Box 2005
Tarrytown, NY 10591-9005
Tel. (914) 785-7113
Fax. (914) 785-7102
MGW/22816A2